BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 10084434 9

CASEBOOK ON CANADIAN INSOLVENCY AND RECEIVERSHIP LAW

PROFESSOR JACOB S. ZIEGEL

With the assistance of Jonathan Yen, Paul Veugelers,
Hilda Wong and Jeffrey Singer.

FALL 1991

The materials reproduced in this casebook are for the use of the students at the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto, and are not for commercial sale.

Storage

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY

AUG 20 1991

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

CASEBOOK ON CANADIAN INSOLVENCY AND RECEIVERSHIP LAW

PROFESSOR JACOB S. ZIEGEL

With the assistance of Jonathan Yen, Paul Veugelers,
Hilda Wong and Jeffrey Singer.

FALL 1991

The materials reproduced in this casebook
are for the use of the students at the
Faculty of Law, University of Toronto, and
are not for commercial sale.

Printed on
Recycled Paper

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/casebookoncanadi00zieg_0

PREFACE TO 1988 EDITION

The materials in this volume, collated under considerable pressure, are designed for an introductory one-semester, two-hours-a-week seminar on Canadian bankruptcy and receivership law.

I owe two particular debts. One is to Jonathan Yen (U. of T., LL.B. 1987) for shouldering much of the burden of compiling the materials; the other is to the editors of Gertner, Springman, McGuinness, Morrison, Stewart and Laskin, Debtor and Creditor, 3rd ed. (1987), and especially to Jody Morrison and George Stewart for facilitating my task of selecting suitable bankruptcy cases.

J.S.Z.

10.8.88

PREFACE TO 1991 EDITION

The most important change made to this edition of the Casebook has been the addition of Bill C-22, 1991, the Bankruptcy Amendment Bill. This appears in the form of an appendix to the volume. Because the seminar this year will only run for 12 weeks, I have also been obliged to omit the block of materials that appeared in previous editions on the fixed and floating charge.

Jeff Singer, LL.B. II, deserves my warm appreciation for assuming much of the burden of updating the Casebook.

J.S.Z.

25.7.92

CASEBOOK ON CANADIAN INSOLVENCY AND RECEIVERSHIP LAW, FALL 1991
SYLLABUS AND TABLE OF CONTENTS

Page No.

Preface i

Selected Bibliography xii

Week 1, Sept. 13: THE OBJECTIVES OF BANKRUPTCY LAW, CANADIAN HISTORY AND CURRENT PROCEDURES FOR MAKING A PERSON BANKRUPT

1. Objectives and History of Bankruptcy Law:

Extracts, Jackson, The Logic and Limits of Bankruptcy Law 1

Extracts, Tassé Report, "The History of Bankruptcy" ... 12

Id., "The Present Canadian Legislation" 18

Id., "The Canadian Legislation Since Confederation" 23

"Bankruptcy Statistics" 29

Corcoran, "Bankruptcies: Why Are They so Low?", Globe and Mail (April 26, 1991) 32

2. Commencement of Bankruptcy Proceedings:

A. Involuntary Bankruptcy:

Bankruptcy Act, R.S.C. 1985: ss. 42-46, 2 (definition of "locality of a debtor"), 12(1), 187(9) to (11)

Re Holmes and Sinclair 33

Re Cedarhurst Properties Ltd 36

Re Gaudet 40

B. Voluntary Bankruptcy:

Bankruptcy Act, R.S.C. 1985: ss. 49, 42(2), 181, 155, 2 (definitions of "insolvent person", "locality of a debtor", "person" and "corporation")

In re Johns Manville Corp. 46

C. Consequences of Receiving Order/Assignment:

Bankruptcy Act, R.S.C. 1985: ss 69(1), 70(1), 71(2), 73

Week 2, Sept. 16: COLLECTION OF BANKRUPT ESTATE AND PROPERTY EXCLUDED THEREFROM

Bankruptcy Act, R.S.C. 1985: ss 67-68, 70-75

1. "Property" Vesting in Trustee -- Exceptions thereto:

Re Ritenburg; Ritenburg v. Crown Trust Company 49

Deloitte, Haskins & Sells Limited v. Graham 53

Tremeear, "Where Personal Injury Claims of Debtor are not Assets in Bankruptcy" 57

Re Airey 61

2. Executory Contracts and Leases:

Re Limestone Electric & Supply Co. 63

Landlord and Tenant Act, R.S.O. 1980 c.232: s. 38(2) 67

3. Exempt Property:

Re Neuls and Neuls; Touche Ross Limited v. First City Trust Company 68

Extract, Tassé Report, "Exemptions" 77

Execution Act, R.S.O. 1980 c. 146: s. 2 78

Re Rasky 79

Re Szatmari 80

Re Saccary 83

Bankruptcy Amendment Bill, C-22, adding new s.68 ..... Appendix

4. Property Subject to a Trust:

Bankruptcy Act, R.S.C. 1985: s. 67

James F. Lawrie & Company Limited v. Moffat 85

Royal Bank of Canada v. 216200 Alberta Ltd 89

See also, infra, Week

5. Property Subject to a Consensual Security Interest:

See, infra, Week 4

Week 3 Sept. 23: AVOIDANCE AND REVIEW OF ANTECEDENT TRANSACTIONS

Bankruptcy Act, R.S.C. 1985: ss. 38, 68(1)

1. Avoidance of Security Interests

Personal Property Security Act, 1989: s. 20

Re Bellini Manufacturing and Importing Ltd 93

International Harvester v. Touche Ross 96

Notes 104

2. Settlements

Bankruptcy Act, R.S.C. 1985: ss. 91-93

Re Whetstone 106

Re Camgoz 114

3. Reviewable Transactions

Bankruptcy Act, R.S.C. 1985: ss. 100-101

Extract, B.C.L.R.C. Report 120

Clarkson v. White 129

Plaskett & Associates Ltd. v. Salvati 132

4. Preferences

Bankruptcy Act, R.S.C. 1985: s. 95

Hudson v. Benallack 145

Re Van Der Liek 149

Fraudulent Conveyances Act, R.S.O. 1980, c. 176: ss. 1-8. 151

Toronto-Dominion Bank v. Miller 153

Extract, B.C.L.R.C. Report 156

5. Protected Transactions

Bankruptcy Act, R.S.C. 1985: s. 95

6. Interaction of Federal and Provincial Legislation and Constitutional Issues

Robinson v. Countrywide Factors Ltd 162

Pacaar Financial Services v. Sinco Trucking 170

Optical Recording Laboratories Inc v. Digital Recording Corp. 179

Week 4 Sept. 30: TREATMENT OF SECURED CREDITORS

1. Ziegel & Garton: Statistical Profile of Creditors in Bankruptcy 187

2. Property Subject to a Security Interest:

Bankruptcy Act, R.S.C. 1985: ss. 71(2), 2 (definition of "secured creditor")

Re Bright 192

Re Szeles 199

Extract, Ziegel, Geva and Cuming, Commercial and Consumer Transactions, 2d ed. 203

Personal Property Security Act, 1989: ss 1-2, 9-15

Extract, Varley, "Receivership: The Contest Between Secured and General Creditors" 210

Goode, "Is the Law Too Favourable to Secured Creditors?". 214

Ziegel, "Too Much, Too Little, or Just Right?" 227

3. Treatment of Secured Creditors under the Act:

Bankruptcy Act, R.S.C. 1985: ss. 127, 128, 132, 133

Extract, Houlden and Morawetz, Bankruptcy Law of Canada 233

Re Ryan 235

4. The New Unpaid Suppliers' 30 day Provision:

Bankruptcy Amendment Act, Bill C-22, s.81.1 ..... Appendix

Week 5 Oct. 7: STATUTORY TRUSTS AND SUPERPRIORITY GOVERNMENT LIEN CLAIMS

Bankruptcy Act, R.S.C. 1985: ss. 136(1), 67

Deputy Minister of Revenue v. Paul Rainville 238

Deloitte Haskins and Sells Limited v. W.C.B. 242

British Columbia v. Henfrey Samson Belair Ltd 249

Bank of Montreal v. Scott Road Enterprises 254

Extract, Advisory Committee Report, "Crown Priority" ... 262

Bankruptcy Amendment Act, Bill C-22, 1991, new ss.86-87 Appendix

Week 6 Oct. 21: DISTRIBUTION OF BANKRUPT'S ESTATE: PREFERRED CLAIMS (See also, supra, Week 4)

Bankruptcy Act, R.S.C. 1985: s. 136(1)

1. Landlord's Claim:

In re Gingras 266

2. Wage Earners' Priorities:

Extracts, Advisory Committee Report, "Wage Earners' Protection" 270

Bankruptcy Amendment Act, Bill C-22, 1991, Pt.I .....
Appendix

See also materials, supra, week 5

3. Directors' Liabilities for Unpaid Wages and Other Benefits:

OBCA s. 131 ..... ___

CBCA s. 114 ..... ___

Ontario, Bill 70, 1991, Pt. XII-A 284

Ontario, Bill 70, 1991, Pt. XII-B 287

Corcoran, "Bankruptcy Tax No Way to Protect Wages", Globe & Mail (June 14, 1991) 291

4. Trustee's Preferred Status and Taxation Principles:

Re Hoskinson 292

Week 7 Oct. 28: CONSEQUENCES OF BANKRUPTCY AND DISCHARGE FROM BANKRUPTCY

1. Consequences of Bankruptcy:

Vachon v. Canada Employment and Immigration Commission .. 299

Amanda Designs Boutique Limited v. Charisma Fashion 307

2. Discharge from Bankruptcy:

Bankruptcy Act, R.S.C. 1985: ss. 169-182

Kozack v. Richter 314

Consumers' Gas Co. v. Stewart 318

Re McAfee 321

Re Robison 332

Bankruptcy Amendment Act, Bill C-22, s.198.1 ..... Appendix

Extract, Jackson, The Logic and Limits of Bankruptcy Law 334

Week 8 Nov. 4 ALTERNATIVES TO BANKRUPTCY: COMMERCIAL REORGANIZATION

Problem 349

Bankruptcy Act, R.S.C. 1985: Part III

Fisher Oil & Gas v. Guaranty & Trust Company 351

Henfrey Samson Belair Ltd. v. A.G. Can. 355

Bankruptcy Amendment Act, Bill C-22, 1991: Division I .. Appendix

Companies' Creditors Arrangement Act, R.S.C. 1970 c.C-25. 358

Elan Corp. v. Comiskey (on issue of trust deed requirement) 362

Re Meridien Developments Inc. 385

In re Bilton Bros. Ltd. 393

Elan Corp v. Comiskey (on issue of voting classes and stay of proceedings) 362

Leonard, "Recent Developments and Trends in Financial Reorganizations" 395

Bankruptcy Amendment Act, Bill C-22, 1991, s.75 et seq. Appendix

Week 9 Nov. 11 COMMERCIAL REORGANIZATIONS AND CHAPTER 11 OF THE U.S. BANKRUPTCY CODE

There will be a separate handout of materials.

Week 10 Nov. 18 CONSUMER ARRANGEMENTS AND CONSUMER BANKRUPTCIES

Bankruptcy Act, R.S.C. 1985: Part X

Orderly Payment of Debts Statistics 409

Extract, Brighton and Connidis, "Consumer Bankrupts in Canada 410

Bankruptcy Amendment Act, Bill C-22, 1991: Division II Appendix

Extract, Sullivan, Warren & Wesbrook, As We Forgive our Debtors, Ch. 18 425

Problem 437

Week 11 Nov. 25 STATUS, DUTIES AND POWERS OF RECEIVERS

1. Definition and History:

Extract, Picarda, The Law Relating to Receivers and Managers 439

2. Court Appointed and Privately Appointed Receivers: Practical and Legal Considerations:

Extract, Bennett, Receiverships 442

Royal Bank of Canada v. White Cross Properties Ltd. ... 444

Federal Trust Company v. Frisina 447

3. Demand for Payment: How Much Time is the Debtor Entitled To?

Kavcar Investments v. Aetna Financial Services 451

Waldron v. Royal Bank of Canada 463

Bankruptcy Amendment Act, Bill C-22, 1991, s.150, adding new s.244 ..... Appendix

4. Differences between Receivers and Managers:

In re Manchester and Milford Railway Co. 467

5. Duties and Powers of Receivers:

CBCA ss. 94-95 (Part VIII) .....

Parsons v. The Sovereign Bank of Canada 472

Kowal Inv. v. Deeder Electric Ltd. 475

6. Status of Receiver as Agent of Company:

Peat Marwick Ltd. v. Consumers' Gas Co. 482

Sperry Inc. v. CIBC 489

7. Termination of Receivership:

Extract, Bennett, Receiverships 494

Week 12 Dec. 2 RECEIVERSHIPS (Cont'd)

7. Rules with respect to Realization:

J & W Investments Ltd. v. Black 502

Cuckmere Brick Co. Ltd v. Mutual Finance Ltd 507

Personal Property Security Act, 1989: s. 63

8. Bankruptcy and Receiverships:

Extract, Bennett, Receiverships 515

Gosling v. Gaskell 517

10

Extract, Advisory Committee, "Receiverships and Secured Creditors" 521

9. Conflicts of Laws Aspects:

C.A. Kennedy Co. Ltd. v. Stibbe-Monte Ltd. 535

Clarkson Co. Ltd. v. Rockwell 544

10. Problem 548

APPENDIX: BILL C-22, BANKRUPTCY AMENDMENT BILL 550

SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY

A. TEXTBOOKS AND MONOGRAPHS: CANADA

T.G. Anderson, Proprietary and Quasi-proprietary Rights Arising upon Insolvency, University of Toronto (1981).

Bankruptcy: Present Problems and Future Perspectives, Faculty of Law, McGill University (1986).

D.G. Baird and T.H. Jackson, Cases, Problems and Materials on Bankruptcy, (1985).

F. Bennett, Receiverships, Carswell (1985).

F. Bennett, Bankruptcy Legislation, CCH Canada (1989).

J.W. Brighton, Consumer Bankrupts in Canada, Consumer and Corporate Affairs Canada (1982).

Business Law: Commercial Insolvency, CBAO (1983).

Duncan and Honsberger, Bankruptcy in Canada, 3rd ed., Canadian Legal Authors Ltd. (1961).

Gertner, Springman et al. Debtor and Creditor: Cases and Commentary, 3rd ed. Carswell (1987).

Houlden and Morawetz, Bankruptcy Law of Canada, 3rd ed., Carswell (1989).

Impact of Insolvency on Business Relationships, CBAO (1987).

Is Bankruptcy Merely "Back to Business"?, CBAO (1983).

Mega International Insolvencies: Are They "Bailouts", Rescues, or Merely Financial Footwork?, CBAO (1983).

Priorities: Who Gets What After the Fall?, CBAO (1984).

Staying Alive: Proposals and Reorganizations, CBAO (1984).

B. TEXTBOOKS AND MONOGRAPHS: ENGLAND AND AUSTRALIA

M. Crystal, A Handbook on Bankruptcy and Deeds of Arrangement Law and Practice, London (1978).

P.G. Earles, A Guide to Bankruptcy, Professional Books (1984).

R.M. Goode, Proprietary Rights and Insolvency in Sales Transactions, Sweet & Maxwell (1985).

W.W. Kerr, Kerr on the Law and Practice as to the Receivers, 16th ed., Sweet & Maxwell (1983).

G. Lightman, The Law of Receivers of Companies, Sweet & Maxwell (1986).

D. Milman, Corporate Insolvency: Law and Practice, Sweet & Maxwell (1987).

J. O'Donovan, Company Receivers and Managers, The Law Book Company Limited (1981).

H.A.P. Picarda, The Law Relating to Receivers and Managers, Butterworths (1984).

P.W.D. Redman, Bankruptcy Law, 7th ed., Macdonald & Evans (1977).

P. Totty, Corporate Insolvency, McGraw-Hill (1982).

C. TEXTBOOKS AND MONOGRAPHS: U.S.

Bankruptcy Reform, American Enterprise Institute for Public Policy Reform (1978).

J.R. Blinn, Bankruptcy Strategies for Lenders, Professional Education Systems (1987).

P. Blumberg, The Law of Corporate Groups: Problems in Bankruptcy Reorganization of Parent and Subsidiary Corporations, Little Brown (1985).

W.M. Collier, Collier Bankruptcy Manual, Matthew Bender (1979).

D.R. Cowans, Bankruptcy Law and Practice, West Publishing (1986).

T.H. Jackson, The Logic and Limits of Bankruptcy Law, Harvard University Press (1986).

L. Kruger and Quittner, Bankruptcy Practice and Procedure, Practising Law Institute (1985).

L. Kruger and Quittner, Current Developments in Bankruptcy and Reorganization, 1986, Practicing Law Institute (1986).

M.S. Lurey, Lending Transactions and the Bankruptcy Code, 1987, Practicing Law Institute (1987).

A.L. Paskay, Handbood for Trustees and Receivers in Bankruptcy, Bender (1978).

D. ARTICLES

W.A. Bogart, "Statutory Claims and Personal Property Security Legislation: A Proposal" (1983) C.B.L.J. 129.

L.J. Crozier, "Good Faith and the Companies' Creditors Arrangement Act" (1989), 15 C.B.L.J. 89.

J.M. Ferron, "The Approach of the Courts to the Discharge of Bankrupt Judgment Debtors" (1985), 61 C.B.R. (N.S.) 134.

A. Giroux, "The Use of the Bankruptcy Act by Secured Creditors" Meredith Memorial Lectures 1985, 232.

R.A. Gitlin, "The International Void in the Law of Multinational Bankruptcies" (1987), 42 Bus. Law 307.

D.B. Gleig, "Unpaid Wages in Bankruptcy" (1987), 21 U.B.C.L.R. 61.

R.M. Goode, "Is the Law Too Favourable to Secured Creditors?" (1983-84), 8 C.B.L.J. 53.

A.K. Kemp-Gee, "Insolvency in Practice: A Receiver's View" in Special Lectures of the Law Society of Upper Canada 1985, 161.

W. Meckling, "Financial Markets, Default and Bankruptcy: The Role of the State" (1977), 41 Law & Contemporary Problems 13.

R.G. Marantz "Current Trends in Canadian Bankruptcy Law" in Special Lectures of the Law Society of Upper Canada 1982, 659.

M. Mendelsohn, "Canada: A Secured Creditor's Paradise?" Meredith Memorial Lectures 1985, 105.

D. Milman, "Receivers as Agents" (1981), 44 M.L.R. 658.

R. Pennington, "The Genesis of the Floating Charge" (1960), 23 M.L.R. 630.

A. Peltomaa, "Constitutional Validity of Provincial Legislation Subordinating Unperfected Security Interests to Trustees in Bankruptcy" 42 C.B.R. (N.S.) 104.

W.T. Plumb, "The New Federal Tax Lien law" (1966-67), 22 Business Lawyers 271.

J.J. Quinn, "Corporate Reorganization and Strategic Behaviour: An Economic Analysis of Canadian Insolvency Law and Recent Proposals for Reform" (1985), 23 O.H.L.J. 1.

R.N. Robertson, "Legal Problems on Reorganization of Major Financial and Commercial Debtors" in Mega International Insolvencies: Are They "Bailouts", Rescues or Merely Financial Footwork?, CBAO (1983).

M. Scott, "The Provinces and the Bankruptcy Act: An End Run", Meredith Memorial Lectures 1985, 73.

M.G. Shanker, "The Worthier Creditors (and a Cheer for the King)" (1975-76), 1 C.B.L.J. 340.

M.A. Springman, "The B.C.L.R.C. Report on Fraudulent Conveyances and Preferences" (1989), 15 C.B.L.J. 180.

H.W. Sterling, "Seizures under Demand Debentures" (1985), 53 C.B.R. (N.S.) 129.

J.R. Varley, "Receivership: The Contest Between Secured and General Creditors" in Debtor-Creditor Law: Practice and Doctrine (Springman and Gertner, eds. 1985).

J.R. Varley, "Recent Developments and Emerging Trends in the Enforcement of Security - The Receiver Beseiged" in Special Lectures of the Law Society of Upper Canada 1985, 181.

J.S. Ziegel, "Consumer Bankruptcies" (1972), 20 Chitty's L.J. 325.

J.S. Ziegel, "Recent and Prospective Developments in the Personal Property Security Area and the Recommendations of the Ontario Advisory Committee" in Special Lectures of the Law Society of Upper Canada 1985, 1.

J.S. Ziegel, "The Supreme Court Scuttles the Deemed Trust in Bankruptcy" (1989), 15 C.B.L.J. 498.

J.S. Ziegel, "The Enforcement of Demand Debentures -- Continuing Uncertainties," (1990) 69 Can. Bar Rev. 718.

E. REPORTS

Brighton and Connidis, Consumer Bankrupts in Canada, Policy Research, Analysis and Liason Directorate, Policy Coordination Bureau, Consumer and Corporate Affairs Canada.

D.J.M. Brown, Final Report of the Commission of Inquiry into Wage Protection in Insolvency Situations (1985).

Law Reform Commission of British Columbia, Fraudulent Conveyances and Preferences, Working Paper No. 53 (1986).

Report of the Advisory Committee on Bankruptcy and Insolvency: Proposed Bankruptcy Act Amendments (Advisory Committee Report), Ministry of Supply and Services Canada (1986).

Report of the Study Committee on Bankruptcy and Insolvency Legislation in Canada 1970 (Tassé Report), Ministry of Supply and Services Canada (1970).

Report of the Review Committee on Insolvency Law and Practice, Cmnd. 8558 (1982).

F. STATUTES: CANADA

Bankruptcy Act, R.S.C. 1985, c. B-3.

Companies' Creditors Arrangement Act, R.S.C. 1985, c. C-36.

Farm Debt Review Act, S.C. 1986, c. C-33.

Fraudulent Conveyances Act, R.S.O. 1980, c. 176.

Winding Up Act, R.S.C. 1985, c. W-11.

An Act Respecting Bankruptcy and Insolvency, Bill C-17, 1984.

The Bankruptcy Amendment Act, Bill C-22 1991.

G. STATUTES: ENGLAND

Insolvency Act, 1986.

H. STATUTES: U.S.

Bankruptcy Reform Act of 1978, Pub. L. No. 95-598, 92 stat. 2549 (1978), (codified at 11 U.S.C. ss. 101 et seq.).

The Bankruptcy Amendments and Federal Judgeship Act of 1984, Pub. L. No. 98-353, 98 Stat. 333 (1984) (enacted July 10, 1984).